

# **Pursuing Assets of Sovereign Debtors**

Michael S. Kim 22 January 2016

#### KOBRE & KIM THE GLOBAL LITIGATION BOUTIQUE

### **Overview of Presentation**

- 1) What should you do in the 6 months leading up to the award?
- 2) How do you find seizable assets?
- 3) Do you really want to try to seize assets?
- 4) Do you have to find assets to monetize the award?



# 1) <u>What Should You Do in the 6 Months Leading up to</u> <u>the Award?</u>

### Do NOT:

- 1. Wait and see if award debtor will pay after the relevant period
- 2. Commission an asset search without judicial proceedings
- 3. Engage counsel in several jurisdictions

### <u>Do:</u>

- 1. Begin enforcement planning <u>6 months before award</u>
- 2. Initiate *judicial discovery*, ideally at the time of registration
- 3. Plan to mount <u>one *significant assault*</u> at the right time.



# 2) How Do You Find Seizable Assets?

### **Challenges**

- Commercial assets are rarely owned directly by the sovereign nation
- Most countries do not allow an award against a parent company to be enforced against the assets of a subsidiary



#### <u>Go after vulnerable assets</u>

- Owned by the award debtor and overlooked in asset protection structuring
- Beneficially owned by the award debtor even though the nominal ownership may be under a different entity

# 2) How Do You Find Seizable Assets?, continued

### Forward Tracing

• Look at where assets belonging to the sovereign debtor *used to be* historically; then, try to trace where the assets were moved.

### **Backward Tracing**

• Identify how the debtor uses assets *today*; then, trace back from the instances of current asset consumption to find the sources.





# 2) How Do You Find Seizable Assets?, continued

Independent Asset Discovery Tools

• Public databases and records (land registries, ship/aircraft registries, company registries, court judgments/filings, shipping records)

Judicial Discovery Tools

- Exequatur orders (e.g., France)
- Subpoenas to third party banks (e.g., U.S.)
- Third party disclosure orders and *Bankers Trust* orders (e.g., U.K.)
- Norwich Pharmacal orders

# 3) **Do You Really Want to Seize Assets?**

- **Caution**: the cost of seizing isolated assets can sometimes exceed their value
- Special obstacles in sovereign debt collections:
  - Complex sovereign immunity laws
    - i.e. Immunity from suit and execution
  - Separate legal entities holding the assets
    Additional immunity issues and difficult 'alter ego' arguments



# 3) Do You Really Want to Seize Assets?, continued

### Freezing Assets

• Freeze orders, Mareva injunctions and asset preservation orders

### Seizing Assets

- Where the debtor maintains legal title:
  - Garnishment proceedings (civil law jurisdictions)
  - Turnover proceedings (New York)
  - Writs of control and execution (U.K.)
- Where the debtor has dissipated assets:
  - Clawback proceedings such as fraudulent conveyance claims
  - Involuntary insolvency proceedings



# 4) Do You Have to Find Assets to Monetize the Award?

Alternatives to direct seizure of debtor assets

- Encourage the debtor to settle
  - Initiate lower-risk proceedings against debtor's commercial counterparties
  - Discovering embezzled proceeds to attach as debtor property
- Selling the award to a distressed debt investor





# Michael S. Kim

<u>michael.kim@kobrekim.com</u> +44 (0) 20 3310 5701 (London) +1 212 488 1201 (New York) +822 369 1201 (Seoul)